2009 Visions of

Computer Sciences Lecture

Socrates, Moore, and Computer Science Education

Alan Kaylor Cline
Department of Computer Sciences
The University of Texas at Austin
November 9, 2009
Outline:
Outline:

• The experience with Halmos
Outline:

- The experience with Halmos
- The effect on me
Outline:

• The experience with Halmos
• The effect on me
• How about computer science courses
And now for something entirely different...
And now for something entirely different...

The presentation of the Holloway Award
My Moore Method course with Paul Halmos
I Want to Be
a Mathematician...

an automathography

Paul R. Halmos
What was he like?
My Moore Method course with Paul Halmos

Set the scene:

Spring semester, 1968
University of Michigan
Functional Analysis I
7-8 students including one undergraduate
First Day Instructions:

• Moore Method or Lectures?
• Halmos:
  • “Borderline too large”
  • “2/3 coverage with Moore Method”
  • “Not like freshman doing homework on the board”
  • “If it takes 30-40 hours of preparation per week, that’s what it takes”
The Format:

• Consult no books
• No collaboration
• Three one hour meetings per week
• Halmos generally called on students to present
• Sometimes he asked for volunteers
• Two or three or four presentations per class
• Following student presentations, he introduced definitions then the theorems and problems (meaning theorems not subsequently used) for us
The Course Changed my Life
The Course Changed my Life
The Course Changed my Life

Was this good or bad?
The Course Changed my Life

• A lifelong mastery of the material
The Course Changed my Life

• A lifelong mastery of the material
• Supreme confidence
The Course Changed my Life

- A lifelong mastery of the material
- Supreme confidence
- A certain guilt/consternation associated with reading others’ work
The Course Changed my Life

• A lifelong mastery of the material
• Supreme confidence
• A certain guilt/consternation associated with reading others’ work
• Nonreliance upon books
The Course Changed my Life

• A lifelong mastery of the material
• Supreme confidence
• A certain guilt/consternation associated with reading others’ work
• Nonreliance upon books, or journals
The Course Changed my Life

• A lifelong mastery of the material
• Supreme confidence
• A certain guilt/consternation associated with reading others’ work
• Nonreliance upon books, or journals, or colleagues
The Course Changed my Life

How much of that was caused by the Moore Method?

and

How much of that was caused by my own situation?
Moore Method Courses
Paul Halmos:

“Some say that the only possible effect of the Moore method is to produce research mathematicians, but I don't agree. The Moore method is, I am convinced the right way to teach anything and everything. It produces students who can understand and use what they have learned. It does, to be sure, instill the research attitude in the student – the attitude of questioning everything and wanting to learn answers actively – but that's a good thing in every human endeavor, not only in mathematical research.

“There is an old Chinese proverb that I learned from Moore himself:

  I hear, I forget;
  I see, I remember.
  I do, I understand.”
Paul Halmos:

“Some say that the only possible effect of the Moore method is to produce research mathematicians, but I don't agree. The Moore method is, I am convinced the right way to teach anything and everything. It produces students who can understand and use what they have learned. It does, to be sure, instill the research attitude in the student – the attitude of questioning everything and wanting to learn answers actively – but that's a good thing in every human endeavor, not only in mathematical research.

“There is an old Chinese proverb that I learned from Moore himself:

I hear, I forget;
I see, I remember.
I do, I understand.”
Is the Moore Method suitable for all Computer Science courses?
Is the Moore Method suitable for all Computer Science courses?

Halmos said:

“The Moore method is, I am convinced the right way to teach anything and everything.”
Is the Moore Method Suitable for all Computer Science Courses?

Halmos said:

“The Moore method is, I am convinced the right way to teach anything and everything.”

“everything”? 
Is the Moore Method Suitable for all Computer Science Courses?

Halmos said:

“The Moore method is, I am convinced the right way to teach anything and everything.”

“everything”? 

Anatomy?
Is the Moore Method Suitable for all Computer Science Courses?

Halmos said:

“The Moore method is, I am convinced the right way to teach anything and everything.”

“everything”?

Anatomy?
Organic Chemistry?
Is the Moore Method Suitable for all Computer Science Courses?

Halmos said:

“The Moore method is, I am convinced the right way to teach anything and everything.”

“everything”?  
Anatomy?  
Organic Chemistry?  
French?  
...
Our department has been a world leader in offering Moore method classes
Our department has been a world leader in offering Moore method classes

At one point courses were being offered by

- Bob Boyer,
- Vladimir Lifschitz,
- J Moore,
- Alan Cline
Our department has been a world leader in offering Moore method classes

At one point courses were being offered by

- Bob Boyer,
- Vladimir Lifschitz,
- J Moore,
- Alan Cline

... which was more than the UT Mathematics Department.
So, When is the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?
So, When is the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

When the

- class size,
- instructor,
- material,
- and (possibly) resources,

are appropriate.
So, When is the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

When the

• class size, if oral presentations, small enough to keep pressure
• instructor,
• material,
• and (possibly) resources,

are appropriate.
So, When is the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

When the

• class size, if oral presentations, small enough to keep pressure
• instructor, prepared for diverse responses
• material,
• and (possibly) resources,

are appropriate.
Moore Method Instructor:
Moore Method Instructor:

The instructor must be prepared to listen carefully to questions...
Moore Method Instructor:

The instructor must be prepared to listen carefully to questions... and then refuse to answer
Moore Method Instructor:

The instructor must be prepared to listen carefully to questions... and then refuse to answer - which doesn’t mean anything like ignoring the question.
So, When is the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

When the

• class size, if oral presentations, small enough to keep pressure
• instructor, prepared for diverse responses
• material, small axiomatic system
• and (possibly) resources,

are appropriate.
So, When is the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

When the

- class size, if oral presentations, small enough to keep pressure
- instructor, prepared for diverse responses
- material, small axiomatic system
- and (possibly) resources, graders for large classes

are appropriate.
So When is **Something Like** the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?
So When is **Something Like** the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

Almost always
So When is *Something Like* the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

Almost always

[in some form or another]
So When is **Something Like** the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

Almost always
(in some form or another)
and we may be already doing it
So When is **Something Like** the Moore Method Suitable for Computer Science Courses?

Almost always
(in some form or another)
and we may be already doing it
(to a degree).
What is **Something Like** the Moore Method?
What is *Something Like* the Moore Method?

A course that has a well-crafted set of exercises that:

- expects a good deal of work to be done by the students
What is *Something Like the Moore Method*?

A course that has a well-crafted set of exercises that:

- expects a good deal of work to be done by the students
- but not so much as to be discouraging
What is **Something Like the Moore Method?**

A course that has a well crafted set of exercises that:

- expects a good deal of work to be done by the students
  but not so much as to be discouraging

- allows for students to be in states of confusion
What is **Something Like** the Moore Method?

A course that has a well crafted set of exercises that:

- expects a good deal of work to be done by the students
  - but not so much as to be discouraging
- allows for students to be in states of confusion
  - but not to the point where nothing is accomplished
What is **Something Like** the Moore Method?

A course that a has a well crafted set of exercises that:

- expects a good deal of work to be done by the students
  but not so much as to be discouraging

- allows for students to be in states of confusion
  but not to the point where nothing is accomplished

- gives students the feeling of discovery and personal participation in the process.
This could be theory
This could be theory
or programming
This could be theory
or programming
or systems
This could be theory
or programming
or systems
or computer applications
This could be theory
or programming
or systems
or computer applications

but it is important that students know enough about the what they are doing to be able to answer questions such as

How do I know when I am wrong?
This could be theory
or programming
or systems
or computer applications

but it is important that students know enough about the what they are doing to be able to answer questions such as

How do I know when I am wrong?

How do I know when I should do better?
“Here’s an outline of the problem, what would you do?”
“Here’s an outline of the problem, what would you do?”

“And what would you do next?”
And what should WE do next?
And what should **WE** do next?

Listen to Jay Misra