

;; Koenig's tree lemma.

;; We use the formulation that says that any finitely  
;; branching tree which is infinite has an infinite branch.

;; More precisely, we consider trees whose nodes are finite sequences  
;; of natural numbers, such that each node's successors are a list  
;; obtained by tacking on some natural number from 1 to the number of  
;; successors. For convenience, I'll keep each node as a list of  
;; numbers where the root is the last element in the list.

EVENT: Start with the initial **nqthm** theory.

;; All this initial stuff is just to get the CONSTRAIN below accepted.

DEFINITION:

ones( $n$ )  
= **if**  $n \simeq 0$  **then** **nil**  
  **else** cons(1, ones( $n - 1$ )) **endif**

DEFINITION:

all-ones( $s$ )  
= **if** listp( $s$ ) **then** (car( $s$ ) = 1)  $\wedge$  all-ones(cdr( $s$ ))  
  **else**  $s = \text{nil}$  **endif**

DEFINITION:

length( $s$ )  
= **if** listp( $s$ ) **then** 1 + length(cdr( $s$ ))  
  **else** 0 **endif**

DEFINITION:

subseq( $s1$ ,  $s2$ )  
= **if**  $s1 = s2$  **then** **t**  
  **elseif**  $s2 \simeq \text{nil}$  **then** **f**  
  **else** subseq( $s1$ , cdr( $s2$ )) **endif**

THEOREM: subseq-all-ones

(all-ones( $s1$ )  $\wedge$  subseq( $s2$ ,  $s1$ ))  $\rightarrow$  all-ones( $s2$ )

DEFINITION:

plistp( $s$ )  
= **if** listp( $s$ ) **then** plistp(cdr( $s$ ))  
  **else**  $s = \text{nil}$  **endif**

THEOREM: plistp-all-ones

$\text{all-ones}(s) \rightarrow \text{plistp}(s)$

THEOREM: all-ones-ones

$\text{all-ones}(\text{ones}(n))$

THEOREM: ones-is-injective

$((i \in \mathbf{N}) \wedge (j \in \mathbf{N}) \wedge (i \neq j)) \rightarrow (\text{ones}(i) \neq \text{ones}(j))$

CONSERVATIVE AXIOM: koenig-intro

$\text{node-p}(\mathbf{nil})$

$\wedge (\text{truep}(\text{node-p}(s)) \vee \text{falsep}(\text{node-p}(s)))$

$\wedge (\text{node-p}(s)$

$\rightarrow (\text{node-p}(\text{cons}(n, s)) = ((0 < n) \wedge (\text{succard}(s) \not\prec n))))$

$\wedge ((\text{node-p}(s1) \wedge \text{subseq}(s, s1)) \rightarrow \text{node-p}(s))$

$\wedge \text{node-p}(s\text{-n}(n))$

$\wedge (((i \in \mathbf{N}) \wedge (j \in \mathbf{N}) \wedge (i \neq j)) \rightarrow (s\text{-n}(i) \neq s\text{-n}(j)))$

$\wedge ((\neg \text{plistp}(s)) \rightarrow (\neg \text{node-p}(s)))$

Simultaneously, we introduce the new function symbols *node-p*, *succard*, and *s-n*.

;; We want to define a function s-height which returns an element of a given height.

;; The next several events culminate in the following lemma:

;; (prove-lemma length-s-height (rewrite)

;; (equal (length (s-height n)) (fix n)))

DEFINITION:

$\text{succ-aux}(s, n)$

= **if**  $n \simeq 0$  **then** **nil**

**else**  $\text{cons}(\text{cons}(n, s), \text{succ-aux}(s, n - 1))$  **endif**

DEFINITION:  $\text{successors}(s) = \text{succ-aux}(s, \text{succard}(s))$

DEFINITION:

$\text{successors-list}(ss)$

= **if**  $\text{listp}(ss)$

**then**  $\text{append}(\text{successors}(\text{car}(ss)), \text{successors-list}(\text{cdr}(ss)))$

**else nil** **endif**

DEFINITION:

$\text{level}(n)$

= **if**  $n \simeq 0$  **then**  $\text{list}(\mathbf{nil})$

**else**  $\text{successors-list}(\text{level}(n - 1))$  **endif**

DEFINITION:

$\text{init-tree}(n)$   
= **if**  $n \simeq 0$  **then**  $\text{list}(\text{nil})$   
    **else**  $\text{append}(\text{level}(n), \text{init-tree}(n - 1))$  **endif**

DEFINITION:

$\text{remove1}(a, x)$   
= **if**  $\text{listp}(x)$   
    **then if**  $a = \text{car}(x)$  **then**  $\text{cdr}(x)$   
        **else**  $\text{cons}(\text{car}(x), \text{remove1}(a, \text{cdr}(x)))$  **endif**  
    **else**  $x$  **endif**

THEOREM:  $\text{length-remove1}$

$(a \in x) \rightarrow (\text{length}(\text{remove1}(a, x)) < \text{length}(x))$

DEFINITION:

$\text{first-non-member-index}(i, x)$   
= **if**  $\text{s-n}(i) \in x$  **then**  $\text{first-non-member-index}(1 + i, \text{remove1}(\text{s-n}(i), x))$   
    **else**  $i$  **endif**

DEFINITION:

$\text{nthcdr}(n, s)$   
= **if**  $n \simeq 0$  **then**  $s$   
    **else**  $\text{nthcdr}(n - 1, \text{cdr}(s))$  **endif**

DEFINITION:

$\text{s-height}(n)$   
=  $\text{nthcdr}(\text{length}(\text{s-n}(\text{first-non-member-index}(0, \text{init-tree}(n)))) - n,$   
     $\text{s-n}(\text{first-non-member-index}(0, \text{init-tree}(n))))$

THEOREM:  $\text{nthcdr-subseq}$

$(\text{length}(s) \not\leq n) \rightarrow \text{subseq}(\text{nthcdr}(n, s), s)$

THEOREM:  $\text{node-p-nthcdr}$

$(\text{node-p}(s) \wedge (\text{length}(s) \not\leq n)) \rightarrow \text{node-p}(\text{nthcdr}(n, s))$

THEOREM:  $\text{lessp-difference-1}$

$(x < (x - n)) = \mathbf{f}$

THEOREM:  $\text{node-p-s-height}$

$\text{node-p}(\text{s-height}(n))$

THEOREM:  $\text{length-nthcdr}$

$\text{length}(\text{nthcdr}(n, s)) = (\text{length}(s) - n)$

THEOREM:  $\text{first-non-member-index-lessp}$

$\text{first-non-member-index}(i, x) \not\leq i$

THEOREM: s-n-first-non-member-index-not-equal

$(i \in \mathbf{N})$

$\rightarrow (\text{s-n}(\text{first-non-member-index}(1 + i, \text{remove1}(\text{s-n}(i), x))) \neq \text{s-n}(i))$

THEOREM: member-remove1

$(a \neq b) \rightarrow ((a \in \text{remove1}(b, x)) = (a \in x))$

THEOREM: s-n-first-non-member-index

$(i \in \mathbf{N}) \rightarrow (\text{s-n}(\text{first-non-member-index}(i, x)) \notin x)$

THEOREM: member-append

$(a \in \text{append}(x, y)) = ((a \in x) \vee (a \in y))$

THEOREM: member-cons-succ-aux

$(\text{cons}(z, v) \in \text{succ-aux}(v, n)) = ((0 < z) \wedge (n \not\leq z))$

THEOREM: node-p-cons-lemma

$(\neg \text{node-p}(s)) \rightarrow (\neg \text{node-p}(\text{cons}(n, s)))$

THEOREM: node-p-cons

$\text{node-p}(\text{cons}(n, s)) = (\text{node-p}(s) \wedge (0 < n) \wedge (\text{succard}(s) \not\leq n))$

DEFINITION:

$\text{all-length-n}(ss, n)$

$= \text{ if listp}(ss) \text{ then } (\text{length}(\text{car}(ss)) = n) \\ \wedge \text{ all-length-n}(\text{cdr}(ss), n) \\ \text{ else t endif}$

THEOREM: all-length-n-append

$\text{all-length-n}(\text{append}(ss1, ss2), n)$

$= (\text{all-length-n}(ss1, n) \wedge \text{all-length-n}(ss2, n))$

THEOREM: all-length-n-succ-aux

$(\text{length}(s) = n) \rightarrow \text{all-length-n}(\text{succ-aux}(s, k), 1 + n)$

THEOREM: all-length-n-successors-list

$\text{all-length-n}(ss, n) \rightarrow \text{all-length-n}(\text{successors-list}(ss), 1 + n)$

THEOREM: length-0

$(\text{length}(s) = 0) = (s \simeq \mathbf{nil})$

DEFINITION:

$\text{member-level-induction}(s, n)$

$= \text{ if } n \simeq 0 \text{ then t} \\ \text{ else member-level-induction}(\text{cdr}(s), n - 1) \text{ endif}$

THEOREM: succ-aux-listp  
 $(\neg \text{listp}(s)) \rightarrow (s \notin \text{succ-aux}(z, n))$

THEOREM: successors-list-listp  
 $(\neg \text{listp}(s)) \rightarrow (s \notin \text{successors-list}(ss))$

THEOREM: member-succ-aux  
 $(s \in \text{succ-aux}(x, n)) \rightarrow (\text{cdr}(s) = x)$

THEOREM: member-successors-list-successors-list-witness  
 $(s \in \text{successors-list}(ss))$   
 $= ((\text{cdr}(s) \in ss) \wedge (s \in \text{successors}(\text{cdr}(s))))$

THEOREM: member-level  
 $((n \in \mathbf{N}) \wedge \text{node-p}(s)) \rightarrow ((s \in \text{level}(n)) = (\text{length}(s) = n))$

THEOREM: member-init-tree  
 $\text{node-p}(s) \rightarrow ((s \in \text{init-tree}(n)) = (n \not< \text{length}(s)))$

THEOREM: length-s-non-member-index  
 $(i \in \mathbf{N}) \rightarrow (n < \text{length}(s\text{-n}(\text{first-non-member-index}(i, \text{init-tree}(n))))))$

THEOREM: length-s-height  
 $\text{length}(s\text{-height}(n)) = \text{fix}(n)$

EVENT: Disable s-height.

;; End of s-height excursion.

;; Our goal:

```
#|
(prove-lemma konig-tree-lemma nil
  (and (node-p (k n))
        (implies (not (lessp j i))
                  (subseq (k i) (k j)))
        (equal (length (k n)) (fix n))))
|#
```

DEFINITION:

$\text{inf}(s)$   
 $\leftrightarrow \forall \text{big-h} \exists \text{big-s} (\text{subseq}(s, \text{big-s})$   
 $\quad \wedge \text{node-p}(\text{big-s})$   
 $\quad \wedge (\text{big-h} < \text{length}(\text{big-s})))$

```
;; The following three events were generated mechanically. They are
;; useful especially for applying the Skolem axioms for INF inside the
;; proof-checker, via the macro command SK*.
```

EVENT: Disable inf.

THEOREM: inf-suff  
 $(\text{subseq}(s, \text{big-s}) \wedge \text{node-p}(\text{big-s}) \wedge (\text{big-h}(s) < \text{length}(\text{big-s})))$   
 $\rightarrow \text{inf}(s)$

THEOREM: inf-necc  
 $(\neg (\text{subseq}(s, \text{big-s}(\text{big-h}, s))$   
 $\wedge \text{node-p}(\text{big-s}(\text{big-h}, s))$   
 $\wedge (\text{big-h} < \text{length}(\text{big-s}(\text{big-h}, s))))$   
 $\rightarrow (\neg \text{inf}(s))$

DEFINITION:  
 $\text{next}(s, \text{max})$   
 $=$  **if**  $\text{max} \simeq 0$  **then**  $\text{cons}(0, s)$   
**elseif**  $\text{inf}(\text{cons}(\text{max}, s))$  **then**  $\text{cons}(\text{max}, s)$   
**else**  $\text{next}(s, \text{max} - 1)$  **endif**

```
;; We want to show that NEXT gives us a successor with infinitely many
;; successors.
```

```
#| INF-IMPLIES-INF-NEXT:
(implies (and (node-p s)
              (inf s))
  (inf (next s (succard s))))
|#
```

```
;; Note that if some successor of s has infinitely many successors, so
;; does (NEXT S (SUCCARD S)). This is the lemma
;; INF-CONS-IMPLIES-INF-NEXT below. But first note:
```

THEOREM: inf-implies-node-p  
 $\text{inf}(s) \rightarrow \text{node-p}(s)$

THEOREM: not-inf-zerop  
 $(i \simeq 0) \rightarrow (\neg \text{inf}(\text{cons}(i, s)))$

THEOREM: inf-cons-implies-inf-next  
 $(\text{node-p}(s) \wedge \text{inf}(\text{cons}(i, s)) \wedge (n \not\prec i)) \rightarrow \text{inf}(\text{next}(s, n))$

;; Our goal now is to apply this lemma by proving that  
 ;; (inf (cons i s)) for some i <= (succard s).

DEFINITION:

all-big-h (*s*, *n*)  
 = **if** *n*  $\simeq$  0 **then** 1 + length (*s*)  
   **else** big-h (cons (*n*, *s*)) + all-big-h (*s*, *n* - 1) **endif**

THEOREM: all-big-h-length  
 length (*s*) < all-big-h (*s*, *n*)

THEOREM: all-big-h-lessp  
 ((0 < *i*)  $\wedge$  (*n*  $\not\prec$  *i*))  
 $\rightarrow$  ((big-h (cons (*i*, *s*)) < all-big-h (*s*, *n*)) = t)

;; Here's a function which tells us which way *s* first branches on its  
 ;; way to extending to *s1*.

DEFINITION:

first-branch (*s*, *s1*)  
 = **if** *s* = cdr (*s1*) **then** car (*s1*)  
   **elseif** *s1*  $\simeq$  nil **then** 0  
   **else** first-branch (*s*, cdr (*s1*)) **endif**

THEOREM: subseq-cons-first-branch  
 (subseq (*s*, *x*)  $\wedge$  (*s*  $\neq$  *x*))  $\rightarrow$  subseq (cons (first-branch (*s*, *x*), *s*), *x*)

THEOREM: length-non-equal  
 (length (*x*) < length (*y*))  $\rightarrow$  ((*x* = *y*) = f)

THEOREM: first-branch-ok-for-succard  
 (subseq (*s*, big-*s*)  $\wedge$  node-p (big-*s*)  $\wedge$  (*s*  $\neq$  big-*s*))  
 $\rightarrow$  ((first-branch (*s*, big-*s*)  $\in$  **N**)  
    $\wedge$  (0 < first-branch (*s*, big-*s*))  
    $\wedge$  (succard (*s*)  $\not\prec$  first-branch (*s*, big-*s*)))

THEOREM: all-big-h-lessp-linear  
 ((0 < *i*)  $\wedge$  (succard (*s*)  $\not\prec$  *i*))  
 $\rightarrow$  (big-h (cons (*i*, *s*)) < all-big-h (*s*, succard (*s*)))

EVENT: Disable all-big-h-lessp.

THEOREM: inf-implies-inf-next  
 (node-p (*s*)  $\wedge$  inf (*s*))  $\rightarrow$  inf (next (*s*, succard (*s*)))

DEFINITION:

$k(n)$   
= **if**  $n \simeq 0$  **then** **nil**  
    **else**  $\text{next}(k(n-1), \text{succard}(k(n-1)))$  **endif**

THEOREM: subseq-nil  
 $\text{subseq}(\mathbf{nil}, x) = \text{plstp}(x)$

THEOREM: node-p-implies-plstp  
 $\text{node-p}(s) \rightarrow \text{plstp}(s)$

THEOREM: inf-nil  
 $\text{inf}(\mathbf{nil})$

EVENT: Disable node-p-implies-plstp.

THEOREM: konig-tree-lemma-1  
 $\text{inf}(k(n))$

THEOREM: length-next  
 $\text{inf}(x) \rightarrow (\text{length}(\text{next}(s, n)) = (1 + \text{length}(s)))$

THEOREM: konig-tree-lemma-2  
 $\text{length}(k(n)) = \text{fix}(n)$

THEOREM: subseq-next  
 $\text{subseq}(s1, s2) \rightarrow \text{subseq}(s1, \text{next}(s2, n))$

THEOREM: konig-tree-lemma-3  
 $(j \not\prec i) \rightarrow \text{subseq}(k(i), k(j))$

THEOREM: konig-tree-lemma  
 $\text{node-p}(k(n))$   
 $\wedge ((j \not\prec i) \rightarrow \text{subseq}(k(i), k(j)))$   
 $\wedge (\text{length}(k(n)) = \text{fix}(n))$

**;; or, if one prefers:**

THEOREM: konig-tree-lemma-again  
 $(n \in \mathbf{N})$   
 $\rightarrow (\text{node-p}(k(n))$   
     $\wedge ((j \not\prec i) \rightarrow \text{subseq}(k(i), k(j)))$   
     $\wedge (\text{length}(k(n)) = n))$



## Index

- all-big-h, 7
- all-big-h-length, 7
- all-big-h-lessp, 7
- all-big-h-lessp-linear, 7
- all-length-n, 4
- all-length-n-append, 4
- all-length-n-succ-aux, 4
- all-length-n-successors-list, 4
- all-ones, 1, 2
- all-ones-ones, 2
  
- big-h, 6, 7
- big-s, 6
  
- exists, 5
  
- first-branch, 7
- first-branch-ok-for-succard, 7
- first-non-member-index, 3–5
- first-non-member-index-lessp, 3
- forall, 5
  
- inf, 5–8
- inf-cons-implies-inf-next, 6
- inf-implies-inf-next, 7
- inf-implies-node-p, 6
- inf-necc, 6
- inf-nil, 8
- inf-suff, 6
- init-tree, 3, 5
  
- k, 8
- koenig-intro, 2
- konig-tree-lemma, 8
- konig-tree-lemma-1, 8
- konig-tree-lemma-2, 8
- konig-tree-lemma-3, 8
- konig-tree-lemma-again, 8
  
- length, 1, 3–8
- length-0, 4
- length-next, 8
  
- length-non-equal, 7
- length-nthcdr, 3
- length-remove1, 3
- length-s-height, 5
- length-s-non-member-index, 5
- lessp-difference-1, 3
- level, 2, 3, 5
  
- member-append, 4
- member-cons-succ-aux, 4
- member-init-tree, 5
- member-level, 5
- member-level-induction, 4
- member-remove1, 4
- member-succ-aux, 5
- member-successors-list-successors-list-witness, 5
  
- next, 6–8
- node-p, 2–8
- node-p-cons, 4
- node-p-cons-lemma, 4
- node-p-implies-plistp, 8
- node-p-nthcdr, 3
- node-p-s-height, 3
- not-inf-zerop, 6
- nthcdr, 3
- nthcdr-subseq, 3
  
- ones, 1, 2
- ones-is-injective, 2
  
- plistp, 1, 2, 8
- plistp-all-ones, 2
  
- remove1, 3, 4
  
- s-height, 3, 5
- s-n, 2–5
- s-n-first-non-member-index, 4
- s-n-first-non-member-index-not-equal, 4

subseq, 1–3, 5–8  
subseq-all-ones, 1  
subseq-cons-first-branch, 7  
subseq-next, 8  
subseq-nil, 8  
succ-aux, 2, 4, 5  
succ-aux-listp, 5  
succcard, 2, 4, 7, 8  
successors, 2, 5  
successors-list, 2, 4, 5  
successors-list-listp, 5