#### Sharing Information The Nature of Social Learning

#### Joanna J. Bryson University of Bath, United Kingdom

#### Outline

- Costs & Explanations of Social Learning
- Adaptive Characteristics of Information Transmission
- Culture, Representation and Human Uniqueness

## Intelligence as Search

- Intelligence is a search for the next action.
  - Preserving solutions ("good tricks") once found is as important as innovation.
- Evolution (biological or cultural), individual learning (including development), and on-line planning are all mechanisms of search.
  - Adaptive modules extend beyond the individual.
  - Good tricks include representations.

Anil K. Seth, Tony J. Prescott & Joanna J. Bryson, *Modelling Natural Action Selection*, Cambridge University Press, 2011.

#### What Is Life About?

- Life persists-primarily through replication-in a dynamic environment.
- Main mechanism: Darwinian Evolution.
  - Evolution: Change over time resulting in diversity.
  - Darwin explained the diversity of species via variation, selection & transmission.

#### **Darwinian Evolution**

- Requires variation, selection & transmission.
  - What is transmitted is the replicator.
  - The unit of selection is the vehicle (or interactor.)
  - In the current ecology, most vehicles are composed of many, many replicators.
  - (Variation matters too)

# Multiple Levels of Interaction $\Rightarrow$ Cooperation



#### **Costs of Socialisation**

- Disease & parasites.
- Competition for food, shelter, mates.
  - Time spent maintaining social structure.



Traditional Explanation (Galton 1871, Hamilton 1973)

- Aggregation as a form of cover seeking.
- Isolation increases probability of being near a predator.



#### Traditional Explanation (Galton 1871, Hamilton 1973)

- Aggregation as a form of cover seeking.
- Isolation increases probability of being near a predator.



#### Why not socialise?

• Disease & parasites.

Competition for food, shelter, mates.

• Time spent maintaining social structure.



Traditional Explanation (Galton 1871, Hamilton 1973)

 Aren't predators a form of parasite?



#### Talk Theses

- Sharing information (and therefore behaviour) is an adaptive strategy, fundamental to sociality and cognition.
- Species and cultures both
  - describe a space of possible solutions,
  - search within that space individually.

### Novel Explanation

- Animals

   aggregate to
   share / exploit
   information.
- Threats,
   Opportunities,
   Behaviour.



photo: Petra Kaczensky





If information sharing is part of a species' adaptive repertoire, then populations may collapse even in numbers sufficient for genetic sustainability.

#### A Computational Advantage

- If every agent has a 1% chance of discovering a skill in its lifetime (e.g. making yogurt), & there are 2000 agents, then at any instant some agents probably have that skill.
- If it is easier to learn the skill from a knowledgeable agent than by discovery, then there is selective pressure for culture.





# History of Social Learning Research

- In the mid-1990s many people doubted social learning occurred except in humans.
  - Altruism impossible to evolve.
  - Correspondence problem too hard.
  - No evidence from nature.
- Note: Rizzolatti didn't solve correspondence, but showed nature has.

# History of Social Learning Research

- In the mid-1990s many people doubted social learning occurred except in humans.
  - Altruism impossible to evolve
  - Correspondence problem too hard.
  - No evidence from nature.

#### 

Chimpanzees (Whiten, Goodall, McGew, Nishida, Reynolds, Sugiyama, Tutin, Wrangham, & Boesch Nature 1999, p. 684).

Macaques (de Waal & Johanowicz 1993); Capuchins (Perry et al 2003); Orangutans (van Schaik et al 2003).



### Solitary Tortoises Use Culture if It's Available

#### Social Learning in a Non-Social Tortoise Anna Wilkinson, Karin Künstner Julia Müller& Ludwig Huber 2010.





## Mobile Genetic Elements (MGEs)

- Traditionally seen as parasites on a cell's reproductive capacity.
- Provide instructions for defence against environmental toxins e.g. heavy metals, antibiotics.

Regulate extent of public goods
 work production, 'altruism' – increase relatedness
 with primarily at social behaviour loci.
 Sam Nogueira et al. (2009) Current Biology
 Brown Rankin et al. (2010) Heredity

#### Outline

- Costs & Explanations of Social Learning
- Adaptive Characteristics of Information
   Transmission
- Culture, Representation and Human Uniqueness

## Explaining Selection for Culture

Čače & Bryson (2007 Springer), Bryson, Lowe, Bilovich & Čače (under revision)

- Environment
- Agents' Attributes
- Agents' Behavior
- Results & Analysis



### Attributes of the Agents

- Species: either talker (altruist) or silent (free-rider.) Permanent, inherited.
- Location: x, y. Age: 0-MaxAge cycles.
- Energy level: moving & breeding costs, eating gains, born with 20% of parent's.
- Knowledge: 5% discover 1 thing, all may overhear. Maximum N things known.

#### How the Agents Behave

- If possible, eat food from present location
  - Food regrows slowly; max one type of food in each place, may not know how to eat it.
- If you have enough energy, reproduce (lose 20% of energy to offspring, share location & species).
- If no energy or too old, die.
- Age, lose energy & move in a random direction.
- If talker, speak. Everyone near listens & learns.

Basic Results: Altruists & Knowledge



Cycles

Cost (in energy ⇒ reproduction) talker (altruist) silent (free-rider)



Number of Extra Food Types Known



talker (altruist) silent (free-rider)

Knowledge (average & standard deviation)

Cycles

## Summary of Results

- It is adaptive though costly to share foodprocessing behaviour.
- A Simpson's Paradox resolved by proximity to similar individuals: determines knowledge.
  - Unlimited motion or transmission eliminate this effect, but these are also totally unrealistic.

viscosity

# Evolving Altruism Does Not Require

- Punishment,
- Tagging / kin recognition,
- Explicit multi-level structure,
- Hard boundaries between groups,
- Memory of individuals / tit for tat.

Joanna J. Bryson, Will Lowe, Avri Bilovich and Ivana Čače, "Factors determining the extent of a species' reliance on socially-acquired behaviour", *under revision*.

- What limits the size of culture?
- Why don't tortoises have laptops?



Biological tradeoffs determine amount of information transmittable per generation.

Cultural evolution determines quality of information.



• The more food that can't be exploited without knowledge, the faster sharing fixates.

Trade-Offs Increasing the Size of Culture

- The longer you live & faster you share the more society knows & the faster sharing fixates.
- The denser the society / higher the carrying capacity of the environment, the more society knows & the faster sharing fixates.

Joanna J. Bryson, Will Lowe, Avri Bilovich and Ivana Čače, "Factors determining the extent of a species' reliance on socially-acquired behaviour", *under revision*.

#### Max lifespan 40 versus 50 cycles Longer life increases cultural accumulation &

selective pressure for culture.



Note also more knowledge when higher proportion of altruists / density of speakers. 40 50





Fig. 5. Plot from the multiple regression analysis of maximum adult lifespan on body and brain size. The y-axis represents the residual variation in adult lifespan after the effect of body size has been removed. The x-axis plots the

Big brains correlate w/ long life, slow maturation, big size & sparseness.
a, b Barrickman, Bastian, Isler & van Schaik (2008): y axes are residuals.
c Brown, Gillooly, Allen, Savage & West (2004)

#### Tradeoffs

- One we know:
  - Lifespan correlates with size. Size trades off against population density.
- One I suspect:
  - Lifespan trades off against biological evolution.

work in progress

#### Outline

- Costs & Explanations of Social Learning
- Adaptive Characteristics of Information
   Transmission
- Culture, Representation and Human Uniqueness

- What limits the size of culture?
- Why don't tortoises have laptops?



Biological tradeoffs determine amount of information transmittable per generation.

Cultural evolution determines quality of information.

#### The Size of a Culture

The amount of information that can be transmitted between generations + Innovation

## Social Learning of Real-**Time Behaviour**



#### Even in VR, intractable without an enormous amount of prior information.



#### Extension of Roy 1999 (PhD) to realtime planning.

(Wood & Bryson 2007) Mark A. Wood and Joanna J. Bryson, "Skill Acquisition Through Program-Level Imitation in a Real-Time Domain", IEEE Transactions on Systems, Man and Cybernetics Part B-Cybernetics, 37(2):272–285, April 2007.

# Learning is Hard ∴ Requires Massive Priors

#### Behaviour Oriented Design facilitates integrating expectations, planning and learning (Bryson 2000-2011)

● ● ●		A.B.O.D.E		
File View Tools Window Help		POSH Engine: Edit File	e in Note 😫 🛠 Run!	
<b>••••</b>	Volumes/jjb/code/jyposh/modules/bo	//////////////////////////////////////		🛠   Commands
Coverview Logical View & Act	tion Patterns SCompetences 🎉	Drive Collections Print View	Source Documentation	X Delete Element
* One-Devet	Sere Sere Sere Sere Sere Sere Sere Sere	as man 20 → Sense armonts → tables-damage-fr 9 - vel.t. → Some 9 - vel.t. → Catalon Annum	set-attacker - face-attacker Actor - face Golf aneman - face Golf aneman - face Source - Trigger Eler respond - Source - Trigger Eler respond - Source - Trigger Eler aneman Ener ph	Contraction Contr
Allack-renery-will- Deve-Conner     Allack-renery-sig- Allack-renery-sig- Allack-renery-sig- Deve-Conner     (7)		emp-ca	Competence Dement	Image: Properties             Competence Elem attack-visible-att           Action Triggered           Retries           O(Unlimited)           Documentation           when it's seen
respond-to-statue     respond-to-statue     respond-to-statue     respond-to-statue     respond-to-statue     respond-to-statue     respond-to-statue     respond-to-statue	Attent Attent	Lame + (L-responding-L.)	retuitater + fact statuter terrer + fact Sait dia discuperation Sait statut discuperation statuter statuter (sait) (sait)	(H Huai
Q Zoom In Q Zoom Out	Validate Primitives	List Primitives 🖾 Export to I	image 🍰 Print Diagram	Rese
Editing attack-visible-attacker		*		



#### (Huang, Leake & Bryson 2011)

Huang, Leake & Bryson, "Humanoid Robots and Cognitive Systems Research: An Epistemological Case Study Based on the iCub" *ICDL-EpiRob*, Frankfurt, August 2011.

- What limits the size of culture?
- Why don't tortoises have laptops?



Biological tradeoffs determine amount of information transmittable per generation.

Cultural evolution determines quality of information.

#### **Cultural Evolution**

- The size of culture is limited by biological constraints—e.g. evolutionary tradeoffs.
  - These change relatively slowly, though they do (co)evolve.
- The extent of culture—the amount of information / behaviour it contains, increases as representations become more efficient (Kirby 1999, Bryson 2010).

Joanna J. Bryson, "Cultural Ratcheting Results Primarily from Semantic Compression", in *Proceedings of the Evolution of Language 2010*, Smith et al (eds.), World Scientific, pp. 50–57, Why are humans special? (Bryson 2008, 2009,2010)

- Humans are the only primate species capable of precise vocal imitation (Fitch 2000; 2007).
- Communicates lots of information, including volume, pitch, timbre and time.
- Allows redundant encoding to preserve important details while others can mutate ⇒ cultural evolution.

Joanna J. Bryson "Representations Underlying Social Learning and Cultural Evolution" *Interaction Studies*, **10**(1):77–100, March 2009.

# Why should temporal imitation matter?

- More information contained in the 'genetic' substrate.
- Allows for more variation while providing redundancy, robustness -- assists GAs (Baluja 1992; Weicker & Weicker; 2001; Miglino & Walker 2002).
- C.f. Wray (2000) on the evolution of language from phrases, Kirby (2000) on cultural selection for language efficacy.

#### Kirby's Iterated Learning

- The size of culture transmitted (# of phrases heard from parent) is the bottleneck in IL.
- Kirby became famous because a fixed size selects for\* increased semantic compression (regularity), thus increasingly more can be communicated between generations greater extent.

\*assuming the representation allows for its evolution

# Why Humans are Special (Bryson EoL 2010)

	temporal imitation	no temporal imitation
big brains, memories	people	non-human apes
no big brains, memories	birds, seals	most things

## Getting Culture from Large Corpus Semantics

- Human semantics can be replicated by statistical learning on large corpra (Finch 1993, Landauer & Dumais 1997, McDonald & Lowe 1998, Bilovich & Bryson 2008).
- The only information gathered on each word's 'meaning' is what words occur in a small window before and after it.
- Normally just use 75 fairly frequent words to watch out for.

Joanna J. Bryson "Embodiment versus Memetics", *Mind & Society*, **7**(1):77–94, June 2008.

### Deacon's (1997) Theory of Semantics



# Bryson's Theory of Semantics



Steels EoL 2006 plenary: coevolution of words & meaning (de Boer, Belpaeme)

#### Tracking Cultural Change

- Bilovich & Bryson (2008)
  - Goal: replicating Banaji implicit language bias data. RTs show implicit correlation between black, left, bad, violence, etc.
  - Cultural stereotypes in an AI (corpusbased) agent?

Avri Bilovich and Joanna J. Bryson, "Detecting the Evolution of Semantics and Individual Beliefs Through Statistical Analysis of Language Use", *Proceedings of the Fall AAAI Symposium on Naturally-Inspired Artificial Intelligence*, J. Beal, P. Bello, N. Cassimatis, M. Coen and P. Winston (eds), pp. 21–26,



#### o"dogs"

#### Avri Bivolich May 2006 dissertation

![](_page_53_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_54_Figure_0.jpeg)

#### Outline

- Costs & Explanations of Social Learning
- Adaptive Characteristics of Information Transmission
- Culture, Representation and Human Uniqueness

#### Conclusions

- Social learning is a key adaptive mechanism for acquiring behaviour.
- The extent of a species' predisposition to use it is determined by a number of adaptive tradeoffs and representations.
  - Humans, as apes with vocal imitation, are more extreme than unique.
- Utilising cultural knowledge may require more systems AI than people want to know.

#### Thanks!

![](_page_57_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_57_Picture_2.jpeg)

Bilovich

Artificial Models of Natural Intelligence: Gideon Gluckman Jason Leake Dominic Mitchell James Mitchell Simon Perkins Marios Richards Karolina Sylwester Daniel Taylor

![](_page_57_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_57_Picture_6.jpeg)

Konrad Lorenz Institute for Evolution & Cognition Research The Nuffield Foundation US Air Force Office of Scientific Research

#### Sharing Information The Nature of Social Learning

#### Joanna J. Bryson University of Bath, United Kingdom